



Towards a causal effective thermodynamics of scalar-tensor gravity [1]

Core problem: Mapping scalar-tensor gravity into Eckart's first-order thermodynamics means formally connecting gravity to a theory that intrinsically suffers from **acausal instabilities**.

Our solution: We cure this pathology by reformulating the formal map to the **Israel-Stewart second-order causal theory**, validating the framework on exact cosmological solutions.

1. Effective Fluid Interpretation

- **Effective dissipative EMT:** Mapping classes of scalar-tensor gravity into **Eckart's thermodynamics** yields:

$$\mathcal{G}_{ab} = \frac{8\pi}{\phi} T_{ab}^{(m)} + \underbrace{\frac{\omega}{\phi^2} \left(\nabla_a \phi \nabla_b \phi - \frac{1}{2} g_{ab} \nabla_c \phi \nabla^c \phi \right) + \frac{1}{\phi} (\nabla_a \nabla_b \phi - g_{ab} \square \phi) - \frac{V}{2\phi} g_{ab}}_{\equiv 8\pi T_{ab}^{(\phi)} \rightsquigarrow \text{Effective dissipative } \phi\text{-fluid EMT}}. \quad (1)$$

- **Fluid decomposition:** Defining the purely kinematic 4-velocity as

$$u^a \equiv \frac{\nabla^a \phi}{\sqrt{-\nabla_a \phi \nabla^a \phi}},$$

$T_{ab}^{(\phi)}$ decomposes into standard effective (ϕ -)fluid variables ($\rho^{(\phi)}$, $P^{(\phi)}$, $q_a^{(\phi)}$, $\pi_{ab}^{(\phi)}$).

- **Effective Temperature:** Applying **Eckart's Fourier Law**, we obtain the thermal parameters in the Jordan Frame [3]:

$$\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} = \frac{\sqrt{-\nabla_a \phi \nabla^a \phi}}{8\pi\phi} \quad (2)$$

Key property: $\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T}$ works as the **order parameter** for the relaxation process toward the stable equilibrium state. General Relativity ($\phi = \text{const.}$) is naturally recovered when $\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} \rightarrow 0$.

2. The Pathology: Acausality

Eckart's constitutive equation for the heat flux [2]

$$q_a = -\mathcal{K}(h_{ab} \nabla^b \mathcal{T} + \mathcal{T} \dot{u}_a) \quad (3)$$

is mathematically parabolic, allowing infinite propagation speeds.

Eckart's Theory

1st Order PDE

Parabolic system

✗ *Acausal Instabilities*

Israel-Stewart

2nd Order PDE

Hyperbolic system (τ_i)

✓ *Causality Restored*

3. Israel-Stewart Constitutive Equations

We fix the acausality by upgrading to the Israel-Stewart transient model [4]:

$$\tau_0 \dot{\Pi} + \Pi = -\zeta \Theta - \frac{\zeta \mathcal{T}}{2} \left[\nabla_c \left(\frac{\tau_0 u^c}{\zeta \mathcal{T}} \right) \right] \Pi \quad (4)$$

$$\tau_1 h_a{}^b \dot{q}_b + q_a = -\mathcal{K} (h_{ab} \nabla^b \mathcal{T} + \mathcal{T} \dot{u}_a) - \frac{\mathcal{K} \mathcal{T}^2}{2} \left[\nabla_b \left(\frac{\tau_1 u^b}{\mathcal{K} \mathcal{T}^2} \right) \right] q_a \quad (5)$$

$$\tau_2 h_a{}^c h_b{}^d \dot{\pi}_{cd} + \pi_{ab} = -2\eta \sigma_{ab} - \frac{\eta \mathcal{T}}{2} \left[\nabla_c \left(\frac{\tau_2 u^c}{\eta \mathcal{T}} \right) \right] \pi_{ab} \quad (6)$$

Minimal ansatz: Assuming the heat flux q^a is time-like ($q^a q_a < 0$):

$$q_a = (-q_c u^c) u_a + h_a{}^b q_b \equiv (q^{(\parallel)}, q^{(\perp)}) \quad \text{with} \quad h_a{}^b q_b^{(\parallel)} = 0, \quad q_a^{(\perp)} u^a = 0.$$

4. Causal Thermodynamics

Applying the causal minimal ansatz and restricting to the subsystem where the generalized Eckart's laws hold, we obtain:

- **Generalized heat flux:**

$$q_a = -\mathcal{K}(\nabla_a \mathcal{T} + \mathcal{T} \dot{u}_a) \quad (7)$$

- **Strictly positive viscous energy density:**

$$\rho_v = -2q_c u^c = 2\mathcal{K} \dot{\mathcal{T}} > 0 \quad \implies \quad \rho = \rho_{\text{pf}} + \rho_v \quad (8)$$

- **Invariant $\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T}$ and relaxation to GR ($\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} \rightarrow 0$):**

$$\frac{d(\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T})}{d\tau} = 8\pi(\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T})^2 - \Theta \mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} + \frac{\square \phi}{8\pi\phi} \quad (9)$$

- **Reduced Israel-Stewart PDEs:**

$$\tau_0 \dot{\Pi} + \frac{\zeta \mathcal{T}}{2} \left[\nabla_c \left(\frac{\tau_0 u^c}{\zeta \mathcal{T}} \right) \right] \Pi = 0 \quad (10)$$

$$\tau_1 h_a{}^b \dot{q}_b + \frac{\mathcal{K} \mathcal{T}^2}{2} \left[\nabla_b \left(\frac{\tau_1 u^b}{\mathcal{K} \mathcal{T}^2} \right) \right] q_a - (q_c u^c) u_a = 0 \quad (11)$$

$$\tau_2 h_a{}^c h_b{}^d \dot{\pi}_{cd} + \frac{\eta \mathcal{T}}{2} \left[\nabla_c \left(\frac{\tau_2 u^c}{\eta \mathcal{T}} \right) \right] \pi_{ab} = 0 \quad (12)$$

5. Application to Cosmology

We test the mapping on exact backgrounds to check the thermal variables.

Bianchi I Cosmology

$$ds^2 = dt^2 + a_1^2(t) dx^2 + a_2^2(t) dy^2 + a_3^2(t) dz^2, \quad a(t) \equiv [a_1(t) a_2(t) a_3(t)]^{1/3}.$$

This anisotropic geometry allows for a remarkable mathematical achievement: the **first consistent decoupling** of the effective thermal conductivity and temperature:

$$\mathcal{K} = \frac{\mathcal{K}_0}{\tau_0 a \dot{a}^2}, \quad \mathcal{T} = \frac{\tau_0 a \dot{a}^2 |\dot{\phi}|}{8\pi \mathcal{K}_0 \phi}. \quad (13)$$

FLRW Cosmology

In the isotropic limit ($a_1(t) = a_2(t) = a_3(t)$), the viscous components mimic a radiation equation of state, $P_v/\rho_v = 1/3$. The relaxation time τ_0 evolves according to:

$$\tau_0 = \frac{C_0 a^{7/2} \phi}{\dot{a}^2}, \quad \frac{\dot{\tau}_0}{\tau_0} = \frac{\Theta}{2} - \frac{2\dot{\Theta}}{\Theta} - 8\pi \mathcal{K}\mathcal{T}. \quad (14)$$

This highlights a physical competition: near GR ($\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} \rightarrow 0$), expansion dominates ($\dot{\tau}_0 > 0$) requiring the causal Israel-Stewart formulation. In strong gravity regimes ($\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} \rightarrow \infty$), the negative term dominates, making Eckart's theory a good approximation.

6. Exact Solutions: Consistency Checks

We validate the causal framework using known exact scalar-tensor solutions, computing explicit time evolution for the relaxation toward GR ($\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} \rightarrow 0$).

Kasner vacuum

Using $a_i \propto t^{p_i}$ and $\phi \propto t^C$, the thermal parameter scales as:

$$\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} = \frac{|C|}{8\pi t(1+C)}.$$

At late times ($t \rightarrow +\infty$), viscous components and $\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T}$ relax to zero, consistently recovering General Relativity as a **stable thermal equilibrium**.

O'Hanlon and Tupper (Power-law FLRW)

Using $a \propto t^q$ and $\phi \propto t^s$, we find:

$$\mathcal{K}\mathcal{T} = \frac{|s|}{8\pi t} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathcal{K} \propto t^{\frac{s-3}{2}}, \quad \mathcal{T} \propto t^{\frac{1-s}{2}}$$

This demonstrates the explicit analytical decoupling of $\mathcal{K}$ and $\mathcal{T}$. At any finite time t , $\mathcal{T}$ is identified as the **true primary parameter** driving the relaxation toward General Relativity.

Conclusions

- ✓ **Causality restored:** The IS map provides a physically viable thermal description of scalar-tensor gravity.
- ✓ **Cosmological impact:** The relaxation time τ_0 gives a practical tool to assess the validity of Eckart's approximation.
- ✓ **Outlook:** Extending the formalism to $f(\mathcal{R})$ gravity and further investigating its implications for cosmological singularities.

Acknowledgments

This work is supported by the National Group of Mathematical Physics (GNFM, INdAM), the Italian Ministry of Universities and Research (MUR) through the grant "BACHQ: Black Holes and The Quantum", INFN (FLAG), and NSERC (Canada).

References

- [1] Narayan Banerjee, Andrea Giusti, Valerio Faraoni, Luca Gallerani, and Alain Maltais-Gosselin. Towards a causal effective thermodynamics of scalar-tensor gravity. 5 2026.
- [2] Carl Eckart. The Thermodynamics of irreversible processes. 3.. Relativistic theory of the simple fluid. *Phys. Rev.*, 58:919–924, 1940.
- [3] Valerio Faraoni, Andrea Giusti, and Andrea Mentrelli. New approach to the thermodynamics of scalar-tensor gravity. *Phys. Rev. D*, 104(12):124031, 2021.
- [4] W. Israel and J. M. Stewart. Transient relativistic thermodynamics and kinetic theory. *Annals Phys.*, 118:341–372, 1979.